

MORE THAN 2,000 scientists, researchers & healthcare professionals
have now signed the John Snow Memorandum.



THE JOHN SNOW MEMORANDUM

Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) has infected more than 35 million people globally, with more than 1 million deaths recorded by the World Health Organization as of Oct 12, 2020. As a second wave of COVID-19 affects Europe, and with winter approaching, we need clear communication about the risks posed by COVID-19 and effective strategies to combat them. Here, we share our view of the current evidence-based consensus on COVID-19.

The John Snow Memorandum October 14, 2020

SARS-CoV-2 spreads through contact (via larger droplets and aerosols), and longer-range transmission via aerosols, especially in conditions where ventilation is poor. Its high infectivity(1) combined with the susceptibility of unexposed populations to a new virus, creates conditions for rapid community spread. The infection fatality rate of COVID-19 is several-fold higher than that of seasonal influenza(2) and infection can lead to persisting illness, including in young, previously healthy people (ie, long COVID(3)). It is unclear how long protective immunity lasts(4) and, like other seasonal coronaviruses, SARS-CoV-2 is capable of re-infecting people who have already had the disease, but the frequency of re-infection is unknown(5). Transmission of the virus can be mitigated through physical distancing, use of face coverings, hand and respiratory hygiene, and by avoiding crowds and poorly ventilated spaces. Rapid testing, contact tracing, and isolation are also critical to controlling transmission. The World Health Organization has been advocating for these measures since early in the pandemic.

In the initial phase of the pandemic, many countries instituted lockdowns (general population restrictions, including orders to stay at home and work from home) to slow the rapid spread of the virus. This was essential to reduce mortality(6),(7) prevent health-care services from being overwhelmed, and buy time to set up pandemic response systems to suppress transmission following lockdown. Although lockdowns

have been disruptive, substantially affecting mental and physical health, and harming the economy, these effects have often been worse in countries that were not able to use the time during and after lockdown to establish effective pandemic control systems. In the absence of adequate provisions to manage the pandemic and its societal impacts, these countries have faced continuing restrictions.

This has understandably led to widespread demoralisation and diminishing trust. The arrival of a second wave and the realisation of the challenges ahead has led to renewed interest in a so-called herd immunity approach, which suggests allowing a large uncontrolled outbreak in the low-risk population while protecting the vulnerable. Proponents suggest this would lead to the development of infection-acquired population immunity in the low-risk population, which will eventually protect the vulnerable. This is a dangerous fallacy unsupported by scientific evidence.

Any pandemic management strategy relying upon immunity from natural infections for COVID-19 is flawed. Uncontrolled transmission in younger people risks significant morbidity⁽³⁾ and mortality across the whole population. In addition to the human cost, this would impact the workforce as a whole and overwhelm the ability of healthcare systems to provide acute and routine care.

Furthermore, there is no evidence for lasting protective immunity to SARS-CoV-2 following natural infection⁽⁴⁾ and the endemic transmission that would be the consequence of waning immunity would present a risk to vulnerable populations for the indefinite future. Such a strategy would not end the COVID-19 pandemic but result in recurrent epidemics, as was the case with numerous infectious diseases before the advent of vaccination. It would also place an unacceptable burden on the economy and healthcare workers, many of whom have died from COVID-19 or experienced trauma as a result of having to practise disaster medicine. Additionally, we still do not understand who might suffer from long COVID⁽³⁾. Defining who is vulnerable is complex, but even if we consider those at risk of severe illness, the proportion of vulnerable people constitute as much as 30% of the population in some regions⁽⁸⁾. Prolonged isolation of large swathes of the population is practically impossible and highly unethical. Empirical evidence from many countries shows that it is not feasible to restrict uncontrolled outbreaks to particular sections of society. Such an approach also risks further exacerbating the socioeconomic inequities and structural discriminations already laid bare by the pandemic. Special efforts to protect the most vulnerable are essential but must go hand-in-hand with multi-pronged population-level strategies.

Once again, we face rapidly accelerating increase in COVID-19 cases across much of Europe, the USA, and many other countries across the world. It is critical to act decisively and urgently. Effective measures that suppress and control transmission need to be implemented widely, and they must be supported by financial and social

programmes that encourage community responses and address the inequities that have been amplified by the pandemic. Continuing restrictions will probably be required in the short term, to reduce transmission and fix ineffective pandemic response systems, in order to prevent future lockdowns. The purpose of these restrictions is to effectively suppress SARS-CoV-2 infections to low levels that allow rapid detection of localised outbreaks and rapid response through efficient and comprehensive find, test, trace, isolate, and support systems so life can return to near-normal without the need for generalised restrictions. Protecting our economies is inextricably tied to controlling COVID-19. We must protect our workforce and avoid long-term uncertainty.

Japan, Vietnam, and New Zealand, to name a few countries, have shown that robust public health responses can control transmission, allowing life to return to near-normal, and there are many such success stories. The evidence is very clear: controlling community spread of COVID-19 is the best way to protect our societies and economies until safe and effective vaccines and therapeutics arrive within the coming months.

We cannot afford distractions that undermine an effective response; it is essential that we act urgently based on the evidence.

The John Snow Memorandum was originally published in *The Lancet* on 14 October 2020.

SIGNATORIES

Prof. Kristina Alexanderson, Stockholm, Sweden

Dr. Rochelle Ann Burgess, Lecturer in Global Health, Institute for Global Health, University College London, UK

Prof. Laura Bear, Professor and Head of Department, Department of Anthropology, London School of Economics, UK

Prof. Reinhard Busse, co-director, European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies; Professor and Head of the Department of Health Care Management, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany

Prof. David Fisman, Professor, Division of Epidemiology, Univ. of Toronto, Canada

Prof. Lynn R Goldman, Professor of Environmental and Occupational Health, Michael and Lori Milken Dean of the Milken Institute School of Public Health, George Washington University, US

Mr. Adam Hamdy, Ligandal Genetic Medicine, San Francisco, US

Prof. David Hunter, Richard Doll Professor of Epidemiology and Medicine; Director, Translational Epidemiology Unit, Nuffield Department of Population Health, University of Oxford, UK

Prof. Paul Kellam, Professor of Virus Genomics, Imperial College London and VP of Infectious Diseases and Vaccines, Kymab Ltd, UK

Prof. Ilona Kickbusch, Founding director and Chair, Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, Switzerland

Dr. Krutika Kuppalli, Assistant Professor, Department of Medicine, Medical University of South Carolina, US

Prof. Jose M Martin-Moreno, Professor, Department of Preventive Medicine and Public Health, University of Valencia, Spain

Prof. Alan McNally, Professor in Microbial Evolutionary Genomics, Director of Institute of Microbiology and Infection, College of Medical and Dental Sciences, University of Birmingham, UK

Prof. Julian Mamo, President, Chronic Diseases Section, European Public Health Association, Associate Professor, Department of Public Health, Faculty of Medicine & Surgery Medical School, Mater Dei Hospital, Msida, Malta

Prof. Jacob Moran-Gilad, Professor of Clinical Microbiology, School of Public Health, Faculty of Health Sciences, Ben-Gurion University, Israel

Dr. Ali Nouri, President of the Federation of American Scientists, US

Dr Alexandra Phelan, Assistant Professor, Center for Global Health Science & Security, Georgetown University, US

Dr. Saskia Popescu, Term Assistant Professor, Biodefense Graduate Program, George Mason University, US

Prof. Stephen Reicher, Bishop Wardlaw Professor, School of Psychology and Neuroscience, University of St. Andrews, UK

Dr. Johanna Riha, Research Fellow, United Nations University-International Institute for Global Health (UNU-IIGH), Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

Prof. Carlo Signorelli, Professor of Hygiene and Public Health at the University of Parma University of Vita-Salute San Raffaele of Milan, Italy

Prof. Devi Sridhar, Professor and Chair of Global Public Health, University of Edinburgh, UK

Prof. Walter Ricciardi, Professor of Hygiene and Public Health, Director of the Department of Public Health and Deputy Head of the Faculty of Medicine, Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, Rome, Italy

Prof. Joshua Silver, Professor of Physics, University of Oxford, UK

Prof. Charles Swanton, Group Leader CEGI Laboratory, Francis Crick Institute, UK; Cancer Research UK Lung Cancer Centre of Excellence, UCL Cancer Institute, London, UK

Prof. Rochelle P. Walensky, Chief of the Division of Infectious Diseases, Massachusetts General Hospital, Professor of Medicine, Harvard Medical School, USA

Dr. Hisham Ziauddeen, Clinical Senior Research Associate, Dept. of Psychiatry & Wellcome Trust-MRC, Institute of Metabolic Science, University of Cambridge, UK; Honorary Consultant Psychiatrist CAMEO, Cambridgeshire and Peterborough

Foundation Trust, UK

Dr. Christian L. Althaus, Head of Interfaculty Platform for Data and Computational Science (INPUT) Institute of Social and Preventive Medicine (ISPM), University of Bern, Switzerland

Dr. Simon Ashworth, Clinical Director of Critical Care, Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust, UK

Dr. Nahid Bhadelia, Medical Director, Special Pathogens Unit, Boston Medical Center; Associate Professor, Section of Infectious Diseases, National Emerging Infectious Diseases Laboratories, Boston University School of Medicine, US

Dr. Colin J. Carlson, Assistant Research Professor, Centre for Global Health Science and Security, Georgetown University, US

Prof. Tim Colbourn, Associate Professor, Institute for Global Health, University College London, UK

Prof. John Drury, Director of Research and Knowledge Exchange in the School of Psychology, University of Sussex, SPI-B advisory sub-group of SAGE, Independent SAGE, UK

Prof. Isabella Eckerle, Head of the Centre for Emerging Viral Diseases, University Hospitals of Geneva and University of Geneva, Switzerland

Prof. Karl Friston, Wellcome Principal Research Fellow and Scientific Director, Wellcome Trust Centre for Neuroimaging; Professor, Institute of Neurology, University College London, UK

Prof. Trisha Greenhalgh, Professor of Primary Care Health Sciences, Nuffield Department of Primary Care Health Sciences, University of Oxford, Co-Director, Interdisciplinary Research In Health Sciences (IRIHS) Unit, UK

Prof. William Hanage, Associate Professor of Epidemiology, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Center for Communicable Disease Dynamics, US

Dr. Zoë Hyde, Researcher, Western Australian Centre for Health and Ageing, The University of Western Australia, Australia

Dr. Michelle Kelly-Irving, Inserm research scientist, Epidemiology and Public Health Unit, Inserm & Université Toulouse III, France

Prof. Sir David King, Former UK Chief Scientific Adviser, Independent SAGE, UK

Prof. Alastair H Leyland, Professor, Institute of Health and Wellbeing, Associate Director, MRC/CSO Social & Public Health Sciences Unit, University of Glasgow, UK

Prof. Martin McKee, Professor of European Public Health, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, Research Director, European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies, and Independent SAGE, UK

Dr. Michael Mina, Assistant Professor, Center for Communicable Disease Dynamics, Department of Epidemiology, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, USA

Prof. Susan Michie, Professor of Health Psychology, University College London and Independent SAGE, UK

Prof. Elias Mossialos, Brian Abel-Smith Professor of Health Policy, Deputy Head of Department, London School of Economics, UK

Prof. Anna Odone, University of Pavia, Italy

Prof. Deenan Pillay, Professor of Virology, Division of Infection and Immunity, University College London and IndieSAGE, UK

Dr. Viola Priesemann, MPRG Group Leader & Fellow of the Schiemann Kolleg, Max Planck Institute for Dynamics and Self-Organization & Bernstein Center for Computational Neuroscience, Göttingen, Germany

Prof. Ken Rice, Professor of Computational Astrophysics, Institute for Astronomy, University of Edinburgh, UK

Prof. Tara Smith, Professor of Epidemiology, Kent State University College of Public Health, US

Prof. Kevin Watkins, CEO, Save the Children, UK

Dr. Clare Wenham, Assistant Professor of Global Health Policy, London School of Economics and Political Science, UK

Prof. Gavin Yamey, Professor of Global Health and Public Policy, Duke University, USA

Dr. Nisreen Alwan, Associate Professor in Public Health, University of Southampton; Honorary Consultant in Public Health, University Hospital Southampton NHS Foundation Trust, UK

Dr. Rupert Beale, Group Leader, Cell Biology of Infection, Francis Crick Institute, UK

Prof. Debby Bogaert, Scottish Senior Clinical Fellow, Professor of Paediatric Infectious Diseases, Center for Inflammation Research, Univ. of Edinburgh, Honorary Consultant in Paediatric Infectious Diseases, Royal Hospital for Sick Children, Edinburgh, UK

Dr. Yves Charpak, Fondation Charpak, l'esprit des sciences, France

Prof. Anthony Costello, Independent SAGE, UK

Prof. Jennifer Dowd, Associate Professor of Demography and Population Health, Deputy Director, Leverhulme Centre for Demographic Science, Univ. of Oxford, UK

Prof. Jacques Fellay, Associate Professor, Groupe Fellay, EPFL; Head of Precision Medicine at the University Hospital (CHUV) in Lausanne, Switzerland

Dr. Valentina Gallo, Neuroepidemiologist, University of Groningen, The Netherlands

Dr. Deepti Gurdasani, UKRI Health-Data Research UK Fellow, and Senior Lecturer in Machine Learning, Queen Mary University of London, UK

Dr. Emma Hodcroft, Molecular Epidemiology Postdoctoral Fellow, Biozentrum, University of Basel, Switzerland

Prof. David Ingleby, Centre for Social Science and Global Health, University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Prof. Kamlesh Khunti, Professor of Primary Care Diabetes & Vascular Medicine, University of Leicester and Independent SAGE, UK

Prof. Florian Krammer, Professor of Microbiology, Icahn School of Medicine at Mount Sinai, US

Prof. Marc Lipsitch, Professor of Epidemiology, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Director, Center for Communicable Disease Dynamics, USA

Dr. Paul McLaren, Adjunct Professor, Department of Medical Microbiology and Infectious Diseases, University of Manitoba, Canada

Dr. Maimuna S. Majumder, Computational Health Informatics Program (CHIP), Boston Children's Hospital, Research Associate, Harvard Medical School, US

Prof. Melinda Mills, Nuffield Professor of Sociology at Nuffield College and Head of the Department of Sociology, Director, Leverhulme Centre for Demographic Science, University of Oxford, UK

Prof. Stuart Neil, Professor of Virology, Head of Infectious Diseases Department, King's College London, UK

Prof. Christina Pagel, Professor of Operational Research, Clinical Operational Research Unit, University College London and Independent SAGE, UK

Dr. Dominic Pimenta, Hospital doctor, Chairman, Healthcare Workers Foundation (HEROES), UK

Dr. Angela L. Rasmussen, Associate Research Scientist, Center for Infection and Immunity, Mailman School of Public Health, Columbia University, New York, US

Prof. Harry Rutter, Professor of Global Public Health, University of Bath, UK

Prof. Gabriel Scally, Visiting Professor of Public Health, University of Bristol, Member of Independent SAGE, UK

Prof. Anthony Staines, Professor of Health Systems, Dublin City University, Ireland

Prof. Robert West, Emeritus Professor of Health Psychology, University College London, UK

Dr. Kit Yates, Co-Director of the Centre for Mathematical Biology, University of Bath, and IndieSAGE, UK

REFERENCES

1. Hao X, Cheng S, Wu D, Wu T, Lin X, Wang C. Reconstruction of the full transmission dynamics of COVID-19 in Wuhan. *Nature* 2020; 584: 420–24.
2. Verity R, Okell LC, Dorigatti I, et al. Estimates of the severity of coronavirus disease 2019: a model-based analysis. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2020; 20: 669–77.
3. Nature. Long COVID: let patients help define long-lasting COVID symptoms. *Nature* 2020; 586: 170.
4. Chen Y, Tong X, Li Y, et al. A comprehensive, longitudinal analysis of humoral responses specific to four recombinant antigens of SARS-CoV-2 in severe and non-severe COVID-19 patients. *PLoS Pathog* 2020; 16: e1008796.
5. Parry J. COVID-19: Hong Kong scientists report first confirmed case of reinfection. *BMJ* 2020; 370: m3340.
6. Flaxman S, Mishra S, Gandy A, et al. Estimating the effects of non-pharmaceutical interventions on COVID-19 in Europe. *Nature* 2020; 584: 257–61.
7. Dehning J, Zierenberg J, Spitzner FP, et al. Inferring change points in the spread of COVID-19 reveals the effectiveness of interventions. *Science* 2020; 369: eabb9789.
8. Clark A, Jit M, Warren-Gash C, et al. Global, regional, and national estimates of the population at increased risk of severe COVID-19 due to underlying health conditions in 2020: a modelling study. *Lancet Glob Health* 2020; 8: e1003–17.